

SILENCING

THE PROMISE OF

THE GUNS

DELIBERATIVE DEMOCRACY

IN HAITI



9722 B/S-6

IRWIN P. STOTZKY

"Irwin Stotzky has written a thought-provoking analysis which captures the challenges that face the Haitian people as they travel down the road toward a democratic society in which political discussion is encouraged and political dissent is accepted. He also stresses the importance for Haiti to be mindful of its violent past while moving Haitian society from a culture of terror to one of democracy and hope."

—**U.S. Senator Russell D. Feingold**

"Irwin Stotzky's *Silencing the Guns in Haiti* is an extraordinary performance: part firsthand reportage by one of President Aristide's confidants, part astute political diagnosis, part constitutional analysis. The book is not only the best analysis of Aristide's return to power, but it is likely to remain the most important account, due to Stotzky's unique perspective and remarkable literary skills."

—**Stanley N. Katz, president, American Council
of Learned Societies**

"No one else is as well situated as Irwin Stotzky to comment on the prospects for democracy in Haiti, and he does so superbly."

—**John Hart Ely, author of *On Constitutional Ground***

"This intriguing and powerful book is one of the most intellectually exciting explorations of the relationship between law, morality, and politics in the transition to democracy that I have read. Irwin Stotzky demonstrates, in the context of the Haitian experience, that political action has a much greater chance of succeeding if it is grounded in rational discourse."

"*Silencing the Guns in Haiti* is a valuable guide for understanding the political struggles in other nations such as Argentina, Chile, and Hungary. Moreover, Stotzky is a participant-observer in many of the situations he describes. My own experiences in Argentina remind me of the emotional and intellectual pressures that Stotzky describes so very well."

"The book invites further development and argument, and will certainly become the focal point of debate on these issues for years to come. *Silencing the Guns in Haiti* is simply required reading for anyone interested in democratic theory and practice, human rights, and the transition process."

—**Raúl Alfonsín, former president of Argentina
(1983–1989) and leader of the Radical Party**

THE UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO PRESS



Contents

Preface	ix
Acknowledgments	xiii
Prologue	1

PART ONE

Democracy in Haiti

A Historical Vision

CHAPTER ONE

A Democratic Vision for Haiti	17
-------------------------------	----

A Historical Vision: The Origins of Dictatorship	17
The First Steps toward Democracy	27

CHAPTER TWO

International Efforts to Restore Aristide to the Presidency	30
--	----

The Preliminary Efforts to Negotiate a Peaceful Settlement	30
The Governors Island Agreement	32
Post-Governors Island Activity	35
The Carter Negotiations and the Return of Aristide	39

CHAPTER THREE

Haiti since Aristide's Return: A Preliminary View	42
---	----

PART TWO

Human Rights and Democratic Theory

CHAPTER FOUR

Searching for Democratic Alternatives in Support of Human Rights	55
---	----

Human Rights	56
--------------	----

CHAPTER FIVE

- A Democratic Vision 62
- Deliberative Democracy 62
- A More Specific Vision of Democracy 66
- Objections 70
- A More Focused Conception of Democracy 73

PART THREE

The Transition from Dictatorship to Democracy

CHAPTER SIX

- The Difficulties of the Transition 79
- The Absence of Material Deprivation: A First Step
toward Democracy 82
- Institutional Organization and the Transition Process 84

PART FOUR

Moving toward a Deliberative Democracy***The Actions of Presidents Aristide and Preval
and the International Community***

CHAPTER SEVEN

- The Aristide Government's Proposal: Strategy of Social and
Economic Reconstruction 105

CHAPTER EIGHT

- Haiti since Aristide's Return: A Closer Look 114
- What to Do about Massive Human Rights Abuses 114
- Prosecutions: The Zimbabwe Trial 120
- Prosecutions: The Jean-Ronique Antoine and
Robert Lecorps Trial 135
- Other Steps toward Justice 139
- Elections 143
- Security and U.S. Involvement in Haiti 159
- The Economy 181
- U.S. Politics: The Presidential Election and Political Murders 191
- Continuing Security Concerns 197

Conclusion 208

Notes 213

Index 279

Prefa

The last two decades of the Latin American and Eastern European transition to democracy in a remarkable political process, authoritarian regimes, tyrannies, dictatorships, have gradually become democracies. This process—authoritarianism to democracy—

One of the best examples of this undertaking is Haiti. The election of Bertrand Aristide as president marked the first time a democratically elected president was elected by very military officers who had ruled that Haiti, which has never known the transition to democracy, is not to slide back to dictatorship. The problems to overcome.

Indeed, the economic transition in Haiti's odyssey from dictatorship to democracy is as difficult as those faced by other countries in the transition process. While the United States and the European Union have provided troops from other countries to provide stability by successfully providing the necessary security, the elected president in the office, that stability is fragile.

It remains unclear whether the democratically elected government will provide the conditions for a democracy of the most powerful forces.